BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10083707 9

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials

Volume I

Brenda Cossman and Carol Rogerson
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

2017-2018

* * *

These materials are distributed solely for classroom use by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

KE
538.5
.C672
2017
v.1
c.1

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

JAN 1 1 2018

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials

Volume I

Brenda Cossman and Carol Rogerson
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

2017-2018

* * *

These materials are distributed solely for classroom use by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/familylawcases01coss

FAMILY LAW
TABLE OF CONTENTS
Volume I

Page No.

I. INTRODUCTION: THE FAMILY AND FAMILY LAW

A. The Family: Definitions and Demographics

Excerpts from Statutes and International Documents 1
Margrit Eichler, "Beyond the Monolithic Bias in Family Literature," *Families in Canada Today* (Toronto: Gage, 1983) at 3 2
Vanier Institute of the Family, "Definitions of Family," *Profiling Canada's Families* (1994) at 10-11 4
Canada (Attorney General) v Mossop, [1993] 1 SCR 554 5
Note: Statistics Canada's Definitions of the Family 10
Vanier Institute of the Family, *Profiling Canada's Families IV* (2010) at xi-xiii, ... 11
Bruce Campion-Smith, "Canada has more same-sex couples, one-person families, census Shows", Toronto Star, August 2, 2017 13
Vanier Institute of the Family, "Facts and Stats: Indigenous Families in Canada" June 20, 2017 16
FTP Ad Hoc Working Group on Family Violence, "Making the Links in Family Violence Cases" (Justice Canada, 2013) at 3-5 (vol 1) and 5-15 (vol 2) 17

B. Legal Regulation of the Family

(a) Public/private

Balfour v Balfour, [1919] 2 KB 571 (CA) 22
Frances Olsen, "The Family and The Market: A Study of Ideology and Legal Reform" (1983), Harvard L Rev.1497 23

(b) Instrumental/normative

Mary Ann Glendon, *Abortion and Divorce in Western Law* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard Univ. Press, 1987) at 7-9 [extract on the educative purpose of law] 25

(c) The Evolution of Western Family Law

John Eekelaar, *Family Law and Social Policy*, 2d ed (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1984) at 15-26 26
John Dewar, "Regulating Families" in Parker et al, *Regulating Law* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004) 29

(d) The Crisis of Access to Justice

Final Report of the Family Justice Working Group: "Meaningful Change for Family Justice: Beyond Wise Words" (April 2013) at 1-2, 5-9, 11-20 34

(e) Federalism

Peter Hogg, *Constitutional Law of Canada* (1985) at 533-534 41

II. MARRIAGE AND NULLITY

A. The Significance of Marriage

(a) The Social Context of Marriage and Other Intimate Relationships

Anne Milan, *Marital Status: Overview 2011* (Statistics Canada, July 2013) at 1-11 42
Statistics Canada, *Portrait of Families and Living Arrangements in Canada* (Sept. 2012) at 7-10, 13-14 [extract couples with children and children's living arrangements] 44
Statistics Canada, "Census in Brief: Same-sex Couples in Canada in 2016" (Aug. 2, 2017) .47
Nathan Battams, "Living Together Apart" Vanier Institute of the Family, *Fascinating Families* (Issue 60, Dec. 2013) at 1 49

(b) The Shifting Legal Significance of Marriage
Sir William Blackstone, *Commentaries on the Laws of England* (1765) 51
William Cobbett, *Advice to Young Men and (incidentally) to Young Women* (1837) 51
Law Reform Commission of Canada, *Bigamy* (1985) at 3 51
Hyde v Hyde (1886), 1 LR (P & D) 130 51
Graham v Graham, 33 F. Supp. 936 (1940) 52
Shelagh Day "The Charter and Family Law" in E Sloss, ed *Family Law in Canada Today* (Ottawa: Can. Advisory Council on the Status of Women, 1985) 27 at 28-30. 54
Note: The Status Implications of Marriage for Indigenous Women 55
Mary Ann Glendon, "The New Marriage and the New Property" in J Eekelaar and S Katz, eds, *Marriage and Cohabitation in Contemporary Societies* (Toronto: Butterworths, 1978) at 59-70 55

B. Unmarried Cohabitation

(a) Social Context
"Then They Won't Get Married" Siri Argell, *Globe and Mail*, Sept. 13, 2007 59
"The New Traditionalists" Leah McLaren, *Globe and Mail*, June 14, 2003 60
"Marriage still valued by youth" Simon Proudfoot, *National Post*, June 8, 2011 64
Anne-Marie Ambert, "Cohabitation and Marriage: How are they Related?" (Vanier Institute of the Family, Sept. 2005) 65

(b) Legal Recognition and Regulation of Unmarried Couples
Note on Terminology 70
Robert Leckey, "Families in the Eyes of the Law" IRRP (July 2009) at 12 [extract on "Legal Models for Regulating Adult Relationships in Canada"] 71
Winnifred Holland, "Cohabitation and Marriage—A Meeting at the Crossroads?" (1990-1991) 7 *CFLQ* 33 73
Miron v Trudel [1995] 2 SCR 418; 76
Note: Determining Whether Unmarried Persons are "Spouses" 80
Molodowich v Penttinen (1980), 17 RFL (2d) 376 (Ont Dist Ct) 81
Note: *Macmillan-Dekker v Dekker* (2000), 10 RFL (5th) 352 (Ont SCJ) 84
Note: *Campbell v Szoke* (2003), 45 RFL (5th) 261 (Ont SCJ) 85
"Ontario's Divisional Court to rule on whether mistress might win spousal support", *Lawyers Weekly*, Nov. 1. 2002 86
Note: *Stephen v Stawecki* (2006), 32 RFL (6th) 282 (Ont CA) 87
Weber v Leclerc, 2015 BCCA 492 88
M v H, [1999] 2 SCC 3 95
Note: The Legislative Response to *M v H* 102
Nova Scotia (Attorney General) v Walsh, [2002] 2 SCR 325 103
Note: Developments in the Law of Unjust Enrichment and Constructive Trusts 118
Note: Legislative Extension of Property Rights to Unmarried Couples 119
Note: Legal Recognition of Unmarried Couples in Quebec; *"Eric v Lola"* and *Walsh* revisited 119
Robert Leckey, "Families in the Eyes of the Law" IRRP (July 2009) at 16-18 [extract on "Form, function and the enduring focus on marriage"] 120

(c) Legal Recognition and Regulation of Non-Conjugal Personal Relationships
"Single Judge Seeks Benefits of Couples" *National Post*, Sept. 22, 2004 123
"Challenging Couple-ism" Editorial, *National Post*, Sept. 23, 2004 124
Note: Australian Capital Territory, *Domestic Relationships Act* 125
Note: Alberta's *Adult Interdependent Relationships Act* (2003) 125
Law Commission of Canada, *Beyond Conjugality: Recognizing and Supporting Close Personal Adult Relationships* (2001) at xi-xix 126

C. Validity of Marriage

(a) Overview

H R Hahlo, *Nullity of Marriage in Canada* (1979) at 1-5 130
Berend Hovius and Mary-Jo Maur, Note on Validity of Marriage, ... 130

(b) Formal Validity: The Ceremonial Requirements for a Valid Marriage

Hassan v Hassan, 2006 ABQB 544 132
Note: *Isse v Said*, 2012 ONSC 1829 135

(c) Opposite Sexes

Note: Same Sex Marriage and Legal Recognition of Same Sex Relationships 136
1. Alternative Mechanisms for Legal Recognition 136
2. Same sex Marriage 137
Halpern v Canada (A.G.) (2003), 225 DLR (4th) 529 (Ont CA.) 138
Note: The Same-Sex Marriage Reference 148
Note: The *Civil Marriage Act* (2005) 149
Note: Same Sex Marriage and Religious Freedom 150
Note: Foreign Recognition of Canadian Same Sex Marriages 152
Note: Bill C-32, An Act to Amend the *Civil Marriage Act* 153
Note: *Hincks v Gallardo*, 2014 ONCA 494 and the Legal Status of Civil Unions 153

(d) Capacity to Consummate

Gajamugan v Gajamugan (1979), 10 RFL (2d) 280 (Ont SC) 157
Dashevsky v Dashevsky (1973), 13 RFL 1 (Ont SC) 158
Norman v Norman (1979), 9 RFL (2d) 235 (Ont UFC) 161
"Judge refuses to annul unconsummated marriage" (re *Falk v Falk*), *Lawyers Weekly*, Oct. 1. 1999 162
Note: *L (KH) v L (G.)* (2003), 231 DLR (4th) 677 (BCCA) 162
Note: *Jomha v Johma*, 2010 ABQB 135 163
Questions 163

(e) Monogamy

Note (i): Canadian Law 164
Note (ii): Polygamy and Polyamory 165
"Polygamous spouses covered under B.C. family legislation, judge holds" *Lawyer's Weekly*, 1 November 1991 [*Basi v Dhaliwal* case] 167
Reference re: Section 93 of the Criminal Code of Canada, 2011 BCSC 1588 168
Susan Drummond, "A Marriage of Fear and Xenophobia: Our Criminalization of Polygamy isn't about Protecting Women" *Globe and Mail*, April 6, 2009 184
Jeff Fraser, "Polyamory: Exploring the Ins and Outs of Multiple Partners" *Globe and Mail*, Sept. 21, 2012 186
J P Boyd, "The polyamorous family" *The Lawyers Daily*, Nov. 10, 2016 188

(f) Age Requirements for a Valid Marriage

Note 191

(g) Prohibited Degrees of Consanguinity and Affinity

Note 191
"Incest: an age-old taboo" BBC News, March 12, 2007 193
"Court annuls marriage between twins separated at birth" *The Guardian*, Jan. 12, 2008 194

(h) Consent as a Requirement for a Valid Marriage

Note 196

(i) Duress

S (A) v S (A) (1988), 15 RFL (3d) 433 (Ont UFC) 197
Note: Duress and Arranged Marriages 200

Note: Forced Marriage and Bill S-7 201
Ashely Csanady, "'Barbaric Cultural Practices' bill to criminalize forced marriage, tackle 'honour killings' passes final vote" *National Post*, June 17, 2015 203

(ii) Limited Purpose Marriage (Immigration Marriages)
Note: *Singla v. Singla* (1985), 46 RFL (2d) 235 (NSSC) 205
Grewal v Kaur, 2011 ONSC 1812 206
Note: "Marriage Fraud" and Immigration 211
Nicholas Keung, "Immigration Guide for detecting marriage fraud called 'racist and Offensive'" *Toronto Star*, May 19, 2015 211
Ron Poulton, "Marriage sponsorship refusals ignore cultural nuance" Canadian Lawyer October 24, 2016 212
"Spouses can sue each other for tortuous deceit" Cristin Schmitz, *Lawyers Weekly,* April 7, 2006 213

III. DIVORCE

A. The Social Context of Divorce

Vanier Institute of the Family, *Profiling Canada's Families IV* (2010) at 44-47, 50-51, 64-66 [extracts on divorce and remarriage] 215
Ann Marie Ambert, "Divorce: Facts, Figures, and Consequences" (Vanier Institute of the Family, revised 2009) 222
Julien D Payne, "The Dichotomy between Family Law and Family Crises on Marriage Breakdown" (1989), 20 *RGD* 109 237

B. Reform of Divorce Law

(a) The Movement to No-Fault Divorce

H R Hahlo, "The Changing Face of Marriage and Divorce" in Rosalie Silberman Abella and Claire L'Heureux-Dubé, eds, *Family Law: Dimensions of Justice* (1983) 239
Note on history of divorce legislation in Canada 242
Dept. Of Justice, *Evaluation of the Divorce Act, Phase II: Monitoring and Evaluation* (May, 1990) at 1-9 242
Note: Divorce Cases 2010/2011 246
Note: Grounds for Divorce, 2008 247

(b) The Continued Relevance of Fault

Sarah Lyall, "Tuna Again? In Fault-Finding Britain It's a Cause for Divorce" *New York Times* (online), April 7, 2012 248
Roger Baron and Shawna Barron, "Divorce law hinders domestic violence victims" *Argus Leader* (online), Oct. 9, 2014 250
"Spousal misconduct returns to divorce?" *Lawyer's Weekly*, 25 March 1988 251
Note: *Valenti v Valenti* (1996), 21 RFL (4th) 246 (Ont Gen Div) 253
"Victim is sued for support" *Toronto Star*, Jan. 23, 2001 253

C. Obtaining a Divorce under the 1986 *Divorce Act*

(a) Grounds for Divorce

(i) Living Separate and Apart
Rushton v Rushton (1968), 2 DLR (3d) 25 (BCSC) 255
*Dupere v Dupere (*1974), 19 RFL 270 (NBQB) 255
Note: Engaging in Sexual Relations after Separation 257
Volcko v Volcko, 2015 NSCA 11 258
Note*: Calvert v Calvert* (1997), 32 OR 281 (Ont Gen Div) 261
Note: Relevance of Date of Separation for Property Division 262
Note: Alternative to Separation as a "No-Fault" Ground for Divorce 262

(ii) Adultery
Mary Ann Glendon, *The Transformation of Family Law* (1989) at 286-287 263
Note: Social Acceptance of Adultery.....263
Note: Definition of Adultery 263
P (SE) v P (DD) 2005 BCSC 1290 264
Notes and Questions 269
"Wife wants divorce for virtual adultery" Ananova, Dec. 25, 2005.....270
Note: Proof of Adultery (*d'Entremont v d'Entremont; Burbage v Burbage*).....270

(iii) Cruelty
Note : Test for Cruelty (*Chouinard v Chouinard*) 270
Austin v. Austin (1970), 2 RFL 136 (Sask CA).....271
Gilbert v Gilbert (1980), 18 RF.L (2d) 240 (NS TD).....272
B (Y) v B (J) (1989), 20 RFL (3d) 154 (Alta QB).....275
S (JG) v S (WOJ), 2004 BCSC 749.....277
Notes 278

(b) Duties and Bars to Proceedings

(i) Condonation, Connivance, Collusion
Christine Davies, *Family Law in Canada* (1986) at 417-437 280

(ii) Inadequate Provision for Child Support
Note.....282

(iii) Religious Bars
"Family Lawyers Get Change" *Law Times*, 1990.....296